

#### Flood Insurance in New York City Following Hurricane Sandy

Lloyd Dixon April 2014



Center for Catastrophic Risk Management and Compensation Changes in the National Flood Insurance Program (NFIP) pose challenges for New York City

- Phase out of many subsidies
- Revisions to NYC flood maps
- Uncertainty regarding premium grandfathering

Changes in the National Flood Insurance Program (NFIP) pose challenges for New York City

- Phase out of many subsidies
- Revisions to NYC flood maps
- Uncertainty regarding premium grandfathering

Analysis based on *Flood Insurance in New York City Following Hurricane Sandy* by Lloyd Dixon, Noreen Clancy, Bruce Bender, Aaron Kofner, David Manheim, Laura Zakaras, RAND, RR-328-NYC, 2013

Available at: http://www.rand.org/pubs/research\_reports/RR328.html

High-risk areas in current flood maps for New York City

2007 FEMA effective FIRM flood zone

VE

A/AE



### **37,500** structures are in high-risk areas of existing flood maps

#### Most are 1–4 family homes



#### 80% of these structures were built before the first flood maps (1983)

#### 55% of 1-4 family structures in high-risk areas had flood insurance on the eve of Sandy

#### Roughly two-thirds of 1-4 family homes comply with the mandatory purchase requirement

	Estimate 1	Estimate 2
Homes in high-risk areas with mortgages (percent)	51	77
Homes in high-risk areas with		
mortgages and flood insurance	71	65
(percent)		

Approximately 20% of 1-4 family structures in high-risk areas without mortgages had flood insurance on the eve of Sandy

### New flood map expands high-risk areas

2013 high-risk areas that were high risk in the 2007 flood map

2013 high-risk areas that were **not** high risk in the 2007 flood map



## Housing units and structures in high-risk areas nearly double



## Updated maps show substantial increases in base flood elevation (BFE)



### Water depth in 100-year flood projected to be large for thousands of parcels



Water depth (feet)

# 7,700 post-FIRM structures affected by map changes

	Insured as	Not insured	
	of Oct	as of Oct	
Scenario	2012	2012	Total
Remapped from Zone X to Zones A or V	400	2,100	2,500
Remain in Zones A or V	3,200	1,900	5,200
Total post-FIRM structures	3,600	4,100	7,700

### Plausible scenarios for post-FIRM structures affected by map changes

Current Map				New Map		
7	<b>–</b> 1	Current	_		Risk- Based	
Zone	Elevation	Premium	Zone	Elevation	Premium	
X	-	429	AE	-1	2,365	
Х	_	429	AE	-9	8,045	

Structures with basement and \$200,000 in building coverage and \$80,000 in contents coverage

### Plausible scenarios for post-FIRM structures affected by map changes

Current Map			New Map		
Zone	Elevation	Current Premium	Zone	Elevation	Risk- Based Premium
X		429	AE	-1	2,365
Х		429	AE	-9	8,045
AE	3	506	AE	1	640
AE	-5	4,100	AE	-7	5,710
AE	3	506	AE	-1	2,365
AE	-5	5,100	AE	-9	8,045

# 45,300 pre-FIRM structures affected by map changes

	Insured as	Not insured	
	of Oct	as of Oct	
Scenario	2012	2012	Total
Remapped from Zone X to Zones A or V	2,800	23,500	26,300
Remain in Zones A or V	11,600	7,500	19,100
Total post-FIRM structures	14,400	31,000	45,300

## Plausible scenarios for pre-FIRM structures affected by map changes

Current Map				New Map		
Zone	Elevation	Current Premium	Zone	Elevation	Risk- Based Premium	
X	_	429	AE	-5	4,100	
X		429	AE	-13	16,291	

Structures with basement and \$200,000 in building coverage and \$80,000 in contents coverage

## Plausible scenarios for pre-FIRM structures affected by map changes

Current Map				New Map		
Zone	Elevation	Current Premium	Zone	Elevation	Risk- Based Premium	
Х		429	AE	-5	4,100	
Х		429	AE	-13	16,291	
AE		3,377	AE	-5	4,100	
AE		3,377	AE	-9	8,045	
AE		3,377	AE	-13	16,291	

# More information is needed to determine actual premium changes

- Better data on structure elevations and basements
- Information on whether a home is a primary residence
- Guidance on how HFIAA will be implemented

### 37% of owner-occupied households have incomes less than \$75,000



Percent of owner-occupied housing units in high risk areas

Property values will likely decrease as flood insurance premiums increase

- Property value would fall \$10,000 for each
  \$500 increase in premium under reasonable assumptions
- Could lead to foreclosures, short sales, and community disruption
- Current, rather than future, property owners bear burden

#### Effects on landlords and tenants

#### Renters

- Rents not expected to change much in the short run
- But in the future a number of factors will determine extent to which landlords can pass rents on to tenants

#### Landlords

- Will bear burden of higher premiums in the short run
- May see property values drop

#### The challenge ahead

- Many good reasons to move to risk-based rates
- Congress appears to be giving the go ahead for a gradual transition to risk-based rates (at least for now)
  - But treatment of map updates remains uncertain
- Over time real estate markets will adjust to higher premiums
  - But affordability issues for current owners will need to be addressed in order to control political opposition to riskbased rates



Center for Catastrophic Risk Management and Compensation